

A long, dimly lit corridor with a series of arches, likely a crypt or underground passage in the Vatican. The arches are made of stone and recede into the distance, creating a strong sense of perspective. The lighting is warm and low, highlighting the textures of the stone and the repetitive architectural elements.

Pachamama Worship in the Vatican: An Artificial Scandal

Michael Lofton

Outline

1. The lead up before the synod.
2. The Vatican garden ceremony itself.
3. The Vatican garden ceremony in the media.
4. Unofficial Vatican explanations.
5. The image thrown into the Tiber.
6. Pope Francis Comments on the Situation
7. The prayer from the Missio Foundation.
8. Condemnations of Vatican idolatry.
9. Taylor Marshall's Involvement.

Caveat

This is NOT an exhaustive treatment of the Vatican garden ceremony in the news - either secular or ecclesial.

The Lead Up Before the Synod

As early as June 18, 2019, some were accusing the synod of serving neo-paganism:

“The working document for the upcoming synod of bishops on the Amazon region represents a “total opening of the gates of the Magisterium to Indian theology and eco-theology” which includes “clearly pagan” and “pantheistic elements of belief,” a Chilean author has said. José Antonio Ureta of the Plinio Corrêa de Oliveira Institute, part of the Tradition, Family and Property movement founded by the eponymous Catholic thinker, said the new document opens the Church up to these two theologies which are “two Latin American derivatives of liberation theology.””

<https://edwardpentin.co.uk/amazon-synod-working-document-criticized-for-serving-neo-pagan-agenda/>

The Lead Up Before the Synod

On Sep. 5th, 2019, LifeSiteNews was accused the synod of heresy:

“How the condemned heresy of modernism has infiltrated the Amazon Synod”

<https://www.lifesitenews.com/opinion/how-the-condemned-heresy-of-modernism-has-infiltrated-the-amazon-synod/>

The Lead Up Before the Synod

On Sep. 12th, 2019 Cardinal Burke (2016 dubia, 2023 dubia) and Bishop Schneider (signer of 2022 document accusing the papal magisterium of teaching heresy) announced a crusade of prayer against the “heresies” of the Amazonian synod:

“Cardinal Raymond Burke and Bishop Athanasius Schneider have issued an eight-page declaration warning against six “serious theological errors and heresies” they say are contained in the Amazonian Synod working document, and calling for prayer and fasting to prevent them being approved.”

[https://www.ncregister.com/blog/cardinal-burke-bishop-schn](https://www.ncregister.com/blog/cardinal-burke-bishop-schneider-announce-crusade-of-prayer-and-fasting)₆
eider announce crusade of prayer and fasting

The Lead Up Before the Synod

1. On October 4th, 2019 Catholics speakers including Michael Voris, John Henry Westen, Michael Matt, Taylor Marshall and others gathered for a conference called Our Church, Reformed or Deformed and sounded the alarm against the pontificate of Pope Francis. Voris called for the pope to resign. - <https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/sounding-the-alarm?fbclid=IwAR1-64xl3j7aK9HMoJEwVSxM2jDTcXOJ-zVwt510ppX2N9m8-iR0tCgqv4Q>
2. Full video of the conference:
<https://gloria.tv/post/tAzZTM6RihuY2Y8LYnthmpqbB?fbclid=IwAR0nMrMM2ibkVxm0AIMfRktBoSdNEACfcLtRIM9AGA8kOmgWPsWp9aMFUIU#1690>

The Lead Up Before the Synod

On Sep. 28th, 2019 priests gather near Castel Sant'Angelo, with the intention of expelling the “diabolical influence from the Vatican, especially in view of the Amazon Synod.” Laity also gathered to pray the rosary for the same intention. John Henry Westen and Michael Matt were in attendance:

“Standing at the foot of Castel Sant'Angelo on the eve of the liturgical feast of St. Michael the Archangel, the international lay coalition launched an “appeal to the angels against the evil spirits,” ahead of the Amazonian Synod being held at the Vatican Oct. 6-27. LifeSite has learned that another act of spiritual warfare was taking place in Rome contemporaneously with the *Acies Ordinata*. At 3:30 pm, priests privately prayed Pope Leo XIII’s Prayer of Exorcism (the longer prayer to St. Michael) in a church near Castel Sant'Angelo, with the intention of expelling the “diabolical influence from the Vatican, especially in view of the Amazon Synod.””

<https://www.lifesitenews.com/news/acies-ordinata/>

The Lead Up Before the Synod

Cardinal Walter Brandmuller (2016 dubia, 2023 dubia) raises his concerns:

“The preparatory documents for the Synod have drawn both controversy and criticism from cardinals and bishops of the Catholic Church. German Cardinal Walter Brandmüller openly saying it contains “heresy” and approaches “apostasy.””

<https://www.lifesitenews.com/news/acies-ordinata/>

The Vatican Garden Ceremony Itself

1. On October 4th, 2019 the Vatican held a ceremony for St. Francis two days before the Amazon synod began. In this ceremony it honored Our Lady of the Amazon.
2. The image is presented to the pope as: “Nuestra Señora de la Amazonia”
3. Pope Francis-Feast of Saint Francis 2019-10-04:
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1wioisaIU2I&ab_channel=VaticanNews (Timestamp 13:27)



The Vatican Garden Ceremony Itself

1. A step by step examination of the ceremony.
2. The TRUTH About the Pachamama Vatican Ceremony:
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=x9vWkXaZp0U&t=763>
S



The Vatican Garden Ceremony Itself

1. The participants were all Catholic.
2. None of the songs were pagan.
3. None of the prayers were pagan.
4. All of the gestures were Catholic.
5. There was no specific veneration to the image in question.
6. The image was identified as Our Lady of the Amazon during the ceremony and was placed next to another image that represented Elizabeth (the Visitation).
7. There were other things in the circle along with the Virgin Mary and Elizabeth, including an image depicting Christian martyrs.

The Vatican Garden Ceremony in the Media

1. On October 4th, 2019 CNA notes the Vatican was not involved in the organization of the ceremony: “A representative from the Vatican Dicastery for Promoting Integral Human Development said after the event that the dicastery's officials were invited to attend the event, but neither organized nor promoted it.”
2. CNA notes the image “reportedly represents the Virgin Mary” but then notes: “Participants sang and held hands while dancing in a circle around the images, in a dance resembling the *"pago a la tierra"* a traditional offering to Mother Earth common among indigenous peoples in some parts of South America. No explanation was provided by the event organizers as to why the dance was performed for the Feast of St. Francis or what it symbolized.”
<https://www.catholicnewsagency.com/news/42454/amazon-synod-ecological-ritual-performed-in-vatican-gardens-for-popes-tree-planting-ceremony>
3. Note CNA made this claim without offering any evidence.
4. Compare Vatican ceremony with a real pago a la tierra ceremony here:
PAGO A LA PACHAMAMA - PAGO A LA TIERRA
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=tmhL5XZjTXk>

The Vatican Garden Ceremony in the Media

October 4th, 2019 the National Catholic Register says the ceremony resembled a *pago a la tierra* offering to mother earth:

“Participants sang and held hands while dancing in a circle around the images. The dance resembled the pago a la tierra, a traditional offering to Mother Earth common among indigenous peoples in some parts of South America. No explanation was provided by the event organizers as to why the dance was performed for the feast of St. Francis or what it symbolized.”

<https://www.ncregister.com/news/ecological-ritual-performed-in-vatican-gardens-for-pope-s-tree-planting-ceremony>

Note CNA reports the same paragraph reported by NCR without any evidence.

The Vatican Garden Ceremony in the Media

1. Pedro Gabriel notes on October 4th, 2019 a photo by Getty Images of Pope Francis at the ceremony describes him in front of “Pachamama” -

<https://www.gettyimages.com/detail/news-photo/pope-francis-and-cardinal-cardinal-cl%C3%A1udio-hummes-news-photo/1178968989?adppopup=true>

2. Is this the first time Pachamama was connected to the ceremony?
3. No evidence is provided for this claim by Getty Images..

The Vatican Garden Ceremony in the Media

On October 4th, 2019 the Sedevacantist website Novus Ordo Watch claims the Vatican Garden ceremony was the worship of Pachamama:

“After declaring that God desires the diversity of religions, that all religions “always look toward heaven and God”, and that religious differences “are necessary”, the apostate Jesuit from Buenos Aires, Jorge Bergoglio (aka “Pope Francis”), has now hosted a syncretistic religious ceremony in the Vatican Gardens that included, beside Christian prayers, the pagan worship of Pachamama, the earth fertility goddess (also known as “Mother Earth” or “Gaia”) adored by the Incas.”

<https://novusordowatch.org/2019/10/golden-calf-vatican-idolatry-francis/>

No evidence was provided for this claim.

The Vatican Garden Ceremony in the Media

On October 5th,
2019 Voris spreads
the claim that the
ceremony was
“pagan.”
No evidence was
provided.



Unofficial Vatican Explanations

On October 7th, 2019 at a Vatican press conference, Bishop David Guinea speaks unofficially (and for a conference not even related to the question) He says:

“I wouldn’t know how to interpret it...we all have our own interpretations, the Virgin Mary, the mother earth, probably those who used this symbol demonstrated...fertility...life...I don’t think we need to create any connections with the Virgin Mary or a pagan element.”

<https://twitter.com/catholicsat/status/1181189628327542785?s=12>

The Vatican Garden Ceremony in the Media

October 10th, 2019 John Henry Westen of LifeSiteNews claims the image was Pachamama.

“That was the sentiment of Bishop David Martínez de Aguirre Guinea, O.P. And when he mentioned “Mother Earth,” you should know that what he’s referring to is exactly a pagan goddess — Mother Earth is a translation of the Inca Pachamama — which is, as you can read in Wikipedia, “a goddess revered by the indigenous people of the Andes. She is also known as the earth/time mother. In Inca mythology, Pachamama is a fertility goddess who presides over planting and harvesting, embodies the mountains, and causes earthquakes. She is also an ever-present and independent deity who has her own self-sufficient and creative power to sustain life on this earth.””

<https://www.lifesitenews.com/blogs/video-an-outrage-either-way-pagan-idol-worship-in-the-vatican-or-a-nude-statue-of-our-lady/>

No evidence was provided to show that the ceremony was the worship of pachamama.

The Vatican Garden Ceremony in the Media

1. October 10th, 2019 The Papal Posse on The World Over claimed the ceremony was the worship of the goddess Pachamama. This was allegedly tolerated by the pope: World Over – 2019-10-10 – The Papal Posse with Raymond Arroyo: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=TVULRtbdNbM&ab_channel=EWTN (05:33-05:45) & (7:21-9:35)
2. Note: It was merely noted that “some said this is the Virgin Mary Our Lady of the Amazon” but it was not shown that the video itself makes that claim.
3. Note: Fr. Murray claims a male god was worshipped at the ceremony as well but the Friar present at the ceremony indicates it was an image of a martyr.
4. Also, note it was merely asserted this was a pagan ceremony but the claim was not substantiated.

The Vatican Garden Ceremony in the Media

On October 11th, 2019, LifeSiteNews ties the Pachamama claim to the *Pago a la tierra* claim made previously by National Catholic Register and Catholic News Agency. It states as a matter of fact that the ceremony was the *pago a la tierra* ritual without any evidence.

“We now know a bit more about what happened after the pagan ceremony of the “Pago à la tierra” (“Payment to the Earth”) in the Vatican gardens under Pope Francis’ very eyes.”

<https://www.lifesitenews.com/news/pagan-ceremony-at-the-vatican-was-just-the-beginning-of-the-irreverent-activity-taking-place-at-synod/>

Unofficial Vatican Explanations

1. On October 11th, 2019, Fr. Roberto Rojas, one of the event organizers, says that the image is Our Lady of the Amazon and is based on a devotion they have to Our Lady. He says: “They carved in wood an image of a Blessed Mother, who is pregnant. She is the Virgin, and we have called her Our Lady of the Amazon.” This is shown in a video entitled: Indigenous missionary defines controversial figure of pregnant “Our Lady of the Amazon”:
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VQSHWGJDJb8&ab_c_hannel=ROMEREPORTSinEnglish (timestamp 00:15-01:21)
2. Note the Our Lady of the Amazon Mission Area here:
<https://arquidiocesedemanaus.org.br/paroq/area-missionaria-nossa-senhora-da-amazonia/>

The Vatican Garden Ceremony in the Media

On October 16th, 2019 Skojec accuses the Vatican of idolatry:

“A number of Catholic commentators, myself included, observed at the time that whatever it was that was happening in the Vatican gardens, it looked very much like some sort of pagan idolatry.”

<https://onepeterfive.com/the-vaticans-continuing-idolatry-problem/>

Unofficial Vatican Explanations

1. On October 16th, 2019, Dr. Paolo Ruffini at a Vatican press conference about the synod notes "strictly in a personal capacity" that the image "is a statue that represents Life, that is it."
2. He also notes "I believe to try and see pagan symbols or to see... evil, it is not."

https://twitter.com/CatholicSat/status/1184454737585934338?ref_src=twsrc%5Etfw%7Ctwcamp%5Etweetembed%7Cwterm%5E1184455530464661506%7Ctwgr%5E221aff0a98b29910feb549816eb62259de855a3d%7Ctwcon%5Es2_&ref_url=https%3A%2F%2Fonpeterfive.com%2Fthe-vaticans-continuing-idolatry-problem%2F

Unofficial Vatican Explanations

1. On October 16th, 2019 Fr. Giacomo Costa SJ, the Secretary of the Information Commission, said the image “is an indigenous woman who brings life” and noted “nobody said it was the Virgin Mary.”
2. He also says he hasn’t even seen the image and was very unsure about the matter.

https://twitter.com/CatholicSat/status/1184455530464661506?ref_src=twsrc%5Etfw%7Ctwcamp%5Etweetembed%7Ctwterm%5E1184455530464661506%7Ctwgr%5E221aff0a98b29910feb549816eb62259de855a3d%7Ctwcon%5Es1__&ref_url=https%3A%2F%2Fonpeterfive.com%2Fthe-vaticans-continuing-idolatry-problem%2F

The Image Thrown Into the Tiber

October 21st, 2019, the images were stolen and thrown into the Tiber. This can be seen in a video entitled: Pachamama idols thrown into the Tiber river!:

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xoB_gjuZgf8&ab_channel=St.BonifaceInstitute

Unofficial Vatican Explanations

1. October 21st, 2019, the Prefect for Communication Dr. Paolo Ruffini says: “We have already repeated several times here that those statues represented life, fertility, mother earth.”
<https://www.vaticannews.va/en/vatican-city/news/2019-10/ruffini-vatican-prefect-on-theft-of-statues-in-rome.html>
2. Note: Pachamama can refer to a pagan goddess or Pacha (earth) mama (mother) as a mere symbol of mother earth. This is why some of the volunteers at the Santa Maria in Transpontina said the image was pachamama (in the latter sense of mother earth - not the pagan goddess).
<https://www.lifesitenews.com/news/symbol-of-life-or-pachamama-vatican-and-repam-synod-organizers-divided-on-identity-of-mysterious-statue/>
3. Also note: The concept of Mother Earth can be found in St. Francis' Canticle of the Sun: “Praised be You, my Lord, through Sister Mother Earth, who sustains us and governs us and who produces varied fruits with colored flowers and herbs.”

Unofficial Explanation

October 23rd, 2019, Brother Afonso Murad, who was involved with REPAM (the group involved with the synod and the Vatican Garden ceremony) explains what the image is:

“I am Brother Afonso Murad, and I am here in Rome at the Synod for the Amazon and I want to clarify something that many people in Brazil asked me to address. This Monday morning, or what seems like it, a small group entered in the Transpontina Church of the Carmelites, where there have been a series of celebrations about the Amazon, happening in parallel with the Synod. Each day there are at least two moments of prayer, besides lectures and expositions. In that context there was a series of symbols which were used at this location. Among them, there were three female silhouettes of an indigenous pregnant woman that symbolized the Earth that takes care of us, and also the indigenous peoples. I want to clarify that contrary to what has been heard in Brazil, that is not a religious image, it was not the object of worship, it’s simply a symbol of the indigenous peoples that has been labeled as if it were an image of Pachamama...”

Unofficial Explanation

“the Mother Earth. The indigenous peoples do not worship images of Mother Earth as we do with an image of Our Lady or the Blessed Sacrament. Therefore it was simply a religious symbol among many that are present in that church for those who want to see it. Therefore, this act was an act of violence, of disrespect and therefore cannot be approved by any of us. Would you like it if someone went to your church and took any of your religious symbols, be it a candle, or a cloth, would you like it? Of course not. Therefore we are clearly against this violent act and we also do not give too much importance to it. Because what is more important is that our eyes, our minds and hearts are directed towards the Amazon, towards the Church in the Amazon and for your mission to announce the Gospel, in a dialogue with the Amazonian peoples.” Translated by Pedro Gabriel

<https://wherepeteris.com/our-lady-of-the-amazon-solving-the-contradictions/>

A video of this may be found here:

<https://www.facebook.com/afonso.murad/videos/10213549974018531/?sfns=mo>

Pope Francis Comments on the Situation

1. On October 25th, 2019, Pope Francis calls the image “pachamama” but notes the images “were there without idolatrous intentions” -
<https://www.vaticannews.va/en/pope/news/2019-10/pope-francis-comments-on-statues-stolen-from-church.html>
2. Reuters noted on the same day: “Vatican spokesman Matteo Bruni said the pope used the word as a means to identify the statues because that is the way they have become known in the Italian media and not as a reference to the goddess.” -
<https://www.reuters.com/article/us-pope-synod-amazon-theft-forgiveness/pope-asks-forgiveness-for-theft-of-controversial-amazon-statues-idUSKBN1X427A/>
3. The transcript of the pope’s words had Pachamama in italics.
4. In the 2020 book Let Us Dream, Pope Francis recalls: “What was beautiful in that synod—the deep respect for indigenous culture and the presence of the native people in the prayer services—was twisted by hysterical accusations of paganism and syncretism. Although we were barely aware of it inside the synod hall, there was no shortage of disturbances outside.”
 - a. This perhaps explains the carelessness of his use of the term Pachamama in the midst of the controversy.

Unofficial Vatican Explanations

On October 25th, 2019, Dr. Paolo Ruffini stated again: “”No prostrations or rituals were performed. We must all be rigorous in telling things that have happened in front of the cameras.”

<https://twitter.com/richraho/status/1187707029235916801?s=21>

Recap

Pedro Gabriel offers the following recap:

1. The native woman and Fr. Rojas say it's Our Lady of the Amazon; They have not attributed a pagan meaning to the figure;
2. Dr. Ruffini, from the Vatican Dicastery of Communications, said in his first answer to the topic (albeit not acting in his official capacity at the time): "I believe to try and see pagan symbols or to see... evil, it is not"
3. Before him, Bishop David Guinea had also been asked about the meaning of the statue, and he replied: "we don't need to create any connections with the Virgin Mary or with a pagan element"
4. Fr. Lopez, interviewed by Inés San Martín: "Asked if it was part of a pagan ritual, the priest offered a flat "no."
5. Br. Afonso Murad is clear that the figure is not a religious image and that it did not receive any kind of cult

Pope Francis Comments on the Situation

On October 27th, 2019, the pope said the following at the Angelus:

“For the way ahead, let us invoke the Virgin Mary, venerated and loved as Queen of the Amazon. She became one not by conquering, but by “inculturating” herself: with a mother’s humble courage she became the protector of her children, the defence of the oppressed. Always going out to the culture of the peoples. There is not a standard culture, there is not a pure culture that purifies the others; there is the Gospel, pure, which is inculturated. To she who cared for Jesus in the poor house of Nazareth, we entrust the poorest children and our common home.”

https://www.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/angelus/2019/documents/papa-francesco_angelus_20191027.html

The Prayer from the Missio Foundation

1. The Missio Foundation, a pastoral body formed by the Italian Bishops' Conference publishes a magazine in April, 2019 containing a prayer on p. 17 to Pachamama.
2. It is not clear whether the magazine was promoting the prayer as something for Catholics or simply as an example of what some in the Andes believe. This resurfaced on October 29th from Catholic Culture, among others, as people were panicking.

A copy of the magazine:

<https://cloud.3dissue.com/77366/77720/110027/Sussidi-Amazzonia/index.html?r=22>

Article about the magazine:

https://www.catholicculture.org/news/headlines/index.cfm?storyid=43919&fbclid=IwAR3xtEbu3yCJ_NuFQyD4EOIpiH55RKvgwQsYHLaw21gMKReOo_ly0

Pope Francis Comments on the Situation

In 2020, Peruvian Dominican theologian Sister Mila Diaz Solano explained what Pachamama means:

“Pachamama is not a goddess, it is not an idol, it expresses a relationship. Pachamama, outside of any indigenous religion, is a Quechua expression rooted in two words pacha which means earth and mama=mother. If you ask a shaman (who is a religious leader from an indigenous religion in the Amazon), or a member of an ancestral religion—non-Christian—the answer you will receive is different than mine. Among indigenous and non-Catholic peoples, Pachamama is their goddess (i.e. the land itself), what we can call “mother nature,” as well as is the water, and other elements of creation. Pachamama has no representation, but many pictures represent the relationship between the people and the land.”

<https://springfieldop.org/what-is-pachamama/>

Unofficial Explanation

On Feb. 2nd, 2020, Pope Francis released *Querida Amazonia* and noted:

“It is possible to take up an indigenous symbol in some way, without necessarily considering it as idolatry. A myth charged with spiritual meaning can be used to advantage and not always considered a pagan error. Some religious festivals have a sacred meaning and are occasions for gathering and fraternity, albeit in need of a gradual process of purification or maturation. A missionary of souls will try to discover the legitimate needs and concerns that seek an outlet in at times imperfect, partial or mistaken religious expressions, and will attempt to respond to them with an inculturated spirituality.”

https://www.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/apost_exhortations/documents/papa-francesco_esortazione-ap_20200202_querida-amazonia.html

Condemnations of Vatican Idolatry

On November 5th, 2019, Fr. Mitch Pacwa claims the ceremony was the worship of an “idol.” This can be seen in a video entitled: Scripture and Tradition with Fr. Mitch Pacwa - 2019-11-05 - 11/05/2019:

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Pea6aaSS8sw&ab_channel=EWTN

Fr. Pacwa gives no evidence for the claim of idolatry in the Vatican other than a personal anecdote and fails to engage all of the evidence to the contrary.

Condemnations of Vatican Idolatry

On October 26th, 2019 Bishop Schneider compares the Vatican Garden ceremony to the golden calf and claims it was pachamama idolatry without any evidence or engagement of the facts.

“In the Oct. 26 open letter, Bishop Schneider is also calling on all Catholics — bishops, priests and laity — to offer acts of reparation, protest and correction for the use of the Pachamama statues, which he calls a “new golden calf.” Bishop Schneider writes: “Syncretism and paganism are like poisons entering the veins of the Mystical Body of Christ, the Church.””

<https://www.lifesitenews.com/news/bishop-athanasius-schneider-issues-open-letter-condemning-pachamama-statue-as-new-golden-calf/>

Condemnations of Vatican Idolatry

In an October 24, 2019, interview with EWTN's Raymond Arroyo, Cardinal Muller (2016 dubia, 2023 dubia) claimed the ceremony was idolatrous without any evidence or engagement of the facts:

“The great mistake was to bring the idols into the church, not to put them out.”

<https://www.lifesitenews.com/news/cardinal-mueller-the-great-mistake-was-to-bring-the-idols-into-the-church-not-to-put-them-out/>

Condemnations of Vatican Idolatry

On Oct. 29th, 2019 Cardinal Brandmuller (2016 dubia, 2023 dubia) claimed the ceremony was idolatrous but provides no evidence and did not engage the facts. He stated:

“These two courageous 'Maccabees' who have removed the 'abomination of desolation in the holy place' are the prophets of today.”

<https://www.lifesitenews.com/blogs/courageous...prophets-of-today-dubia-cardinal-praises-men-who-threw-pachamas-in-tiber/>

Condemnations of Vatican Idolatry

On Dec. 12th, 2019, Cardinal Burke stated in a homily without any evidence and without engage the facts:

“Satan makes bold to sow his lies and the seeds of confusion and destruction also in the Church. A most shocking manifestation of how Satan has entered into the Church was the recent cult of the pagan idol, the Pachamama, mother earth, in the Vatican gardens, and even more grievously, before the tomb of Saint Peter in St. Peter’s Basilica,”

He stated it was, “the most grievous offence to God: the clear and unconscionable violation of the First Commandment.”

<https://www.chi-usa.com/cardinal-burke-catholics-have-our-lady-of-guadalupe-as-mother-not-pachamama/>

Condemnations of Vatican Idolatry

On November 5th, 2019 Vigano speaks out against the Vatican's alleged idolatry of Pachamama:

"Like many others, including Bp. Athanasius Schneider and Prof. Roberto de Mattei, I think that this young man is a hero," the former papal nuncio-turned-whistleblower told Dr. Robert Moynihan in comments made on Monday. "He is a person who wished to defend the First Commandment."

<https://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/vigano-pachamama-activist-a-hero>

On November 7th, 2019 he called for a reconsecration of St. Peter's Basilica for "the appalling idolatrous profanations" and spoke of "The abomination of idolatrous rites has entered the sanctuary of God and has given rise to a new form of apostasy whose seeds, which have been active for a long time, are growing with renewed vigor and effectiveness,"

<https://www.cal-catholic.com/former-papal-nuncio-vigano-goes-after-pachamama/>

Taylor Marshall's Involvement

1. Taylor's involvement in throwing the images in the Tiber.
2. Trent Horn documents Marshall's involvement:
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=R304KOdrmgg&t=8s> (39:00-42:35)
3. Diamond Bros document Marshall's involvement:
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QU4C6MRG5VY&t=465s> (7:45-16:32)

Taylor Marshall's Involvement

Taylor Marshall looks back on the “Pachamama” event in his video Did Pope Francis Watch Taylor Marshall's Podcast and Restrict the Latin Mass over Pachamama?: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=P2hH9N2Yx3c&t=1041s&ab_channel=DrTaylorMarshall (Timestamp 6:11-13:56)

Is the Image Appropriate?



Summary

1. None of the participants of the ceremony believed they were worshipping an idol - the evidence is to the contrary.
2. No conclusive evidence that the ceremony was pagan was ever provided.
3. None of the unofficial clarifications from the Vatican indicated this was pagan.
4. The critics were looking for something to criticize before the synod began and they believe they found something in the ceremony.
5. It was merely assumed by Catholic media that the ceremony was pagan idolatry.
6. Little to no engagement with the facts was made with most in Catholic media.
7. Catholic media, cardinals, bishops, priests and theologians all assumed the ceremony was idolatrous and pontificated about the Vatican's alleged idolatry as if the matter were factual.
 - a. Few in Catholic media actively pushed back against the narrative at the time with the exception of Where Peter Is.

Conclusion

1. Was the ceremony itself idolatrous?
 - a. No.
2. Was it scandalous?
 - a. In some ways, yes. It gave the appearance to the average person of idolatry.
3. Was it confusing?
 - a. Yes.
4. Could the Vatican have done better?
 - a. Yes
 - b. Could have had a better explanation before the event.
 - c. More consistency in the explanation.
 - d. More awareness of what was going on in the media.
5. Some were ready to find something to criticize.
6. The false claim that the image was pachamama did not come from the ceremony itself and the false narrative stuck due to endless media promotion of “Vatican idolatry” with no evidence and little to no engagement of the facts.
7. Is the image appropriate?
 - a. Debatable according to time, place and culture.